



CHANGING ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE IN INDIA – A TREND TOWARDS NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT

D.Menaka Thammaiah

Assistant Professor in Political Science, Govt. First Grade College, H.S.R. Layout, Bangalore, Karnataka.

Abstract

This article examines the meaning of the term Administrative culture. Each nation has its own administrative culture, distinct in its entirety from that of any other nation. Indian administrative culture is different from other countries due to religion, caste, peculiar family system it is dominated by in equalitarian values.

India at the time of independence in 1947 got from the British rules a system administration marked by integrity, impartiality, neutrality and efficiency. The bureaucrats of the British rule in India rendered their best advice and never indulged in criminality, But, thereafter when India become independent changes began to take place gradually and slowly with the consequence that Indian administration came to be categorized the most corrupt one. This article examines these changes in values and culture of administrators. This paper also analysis the paradigmatic shift that took place in the practice of governments and public agencies worldwide since the eighties which has been termed as 'New Public Management' (NPM). With rising tide of 'neo-liberalism country and globalization many suggestions are made in India towards NPM. This paper also analyses the attempts made in India to adapt to this 'new paradigm' called NPM and how NPM in India will help to revitalize the image of the bureaucracy.

I. INTRODUCTION

The seeds of the term “Administrative Culture” were sown in 1963 when Gabriel Almond and Sydney Verba published their path breaking work. “The Civil Culture”¹. The culture of a society gives its citizens various ideological values. The theory and practice of public administration cannot remain immune to such values. Culture relating administrative practice may be called Administrative culture. Conglomeration of attitude, laws, customs, beliefs and values bureaucracy may be called administrative culture. It is manmade part of administrative environment physical as well as nonphysical. Each nation has its own administrative culture distinct in its entirety from that of any other nation. Indian administrative culture is different from other countries. Due to religion, caste, peculiar family system it is dominated by in equalitarian values. Indian model is hierarchical whereas western model i.e., equalitarian. As a result there is individualistic orientation, defication of authority internalization and accommodation in Indian administration².

II. ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE IN PRE-INDEPENDENCE PERIOD

The administrative system under Britishers was entirely bureaucratic in character. Primarily devised for maintenance of law and order and collection of revenues, it was a government by civil servants, who were not responsible to the people over whom they ruled. The system administration was paternalistic, regulatory and rigid with little or no involvement in the development of the country, it was fundamentally non-action oriented. It worked for its foreign masters and the top upper class which supported them. It did not reach the grass roots nor touched the life of the common man. It was status quo oriented and not development oriented. The attitude of the brilliant young men of the Indian civil service towards change was definitely negative. The bureaucracy in India during the British Raj were synonymous with the so called steel frame which was inevitable for maintaining and smooth running of the alien government.³

III. ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE AFTER INDEPENDENCE

After independence the national scenario underwent tremendous change to incorporate the democratic socialistic ethos envisioned in the constitution. Democracy brought in the parliament, ministers, elections and political parties compiled with the concept of public accountability of civil servants. The nature of bureaucratic takes also completely changed in variety, multiplicity and orientation. The emphasis shifted from preventive functions to service and development oriented functions. The government started on an ambitious model of planned development through democratic mean relying on the traditional bureaucracy, which the nation had inherited from the British colonial period, to implement new schemes and programmers. Though the post-independence rulers viewed the old bureaucracy with suspicion they retained, the old structure of administration with piecemeal changes whenever necessary.

Unlike the British period the bureaucracy now had to function in environment where it works under the direction of a political head who is responsible for the department under his charge to the legislature the political elements lays down the public policies, defines the tasks of bureaucracy and supervises their implementation.⁴



IV CHANGE IN ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE FROM NEUTRAL BUREAUCRACY TO COMMITTED BUREAUCRACY

One of the essential attribute of bureaucracy is political neutrality, As Dr. Rajendra Prasad the first president of free India observed. “It is the business of democracy to represent all interests and it is the business of bureaucracy to eliminate all interest, the doctrine of political neutrality was intended to enable bureaucracy to work under governments of different political parties with a sense of neutrality, objectivity and impartiality but with the same a party in power for several years after independence at the centre and in the states, this was forgotten and bureaucratic autonomy in its own sphere was interestingly eroded autonomy to give frank and free advice rather than convenient advice on policy matters and to apply laws and implement policies and programmes without fear or favour. The main contention of Jawaharlal Nehru was that bureaucratic neutrality was all right during the colonial era but was not appropriate in free India where bureaucracy cannot be neutral to the welfare of the people. From this it was logical to proceed to the next step the concept of neutral bureaucracy giving way to the new concept of “committed bureaucracy”. And this is what Indira Gandhi did and with disastrous consequences to the objective and impartial working of the bureaucracy. The clever politicians in such situations, could find easy scapegoats in bureaucracy for actions for which they themselves were responsible.⁵

V. ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE TOWARDS CORRUPTION

The assumption of new responsibilities by the government after independence resulted in highly complicated administrative procedures and red tape. The launching of the economic development. Five year plans from 1951 onwards phenomenally increased government spending Government also entered into all kinds of economic and trading activities banking and Insurance sector came under government ownership and control. Numerous large and medium sized PSUs were set up. “License, Quota, and permit raj” came into being in areas of economy left open for the private sector. All these provided ample opportunities for making large illegal gains by corruption prone ministers and public servants at all levels by abusing their offices and powers. This encouraged the growth of “Speed money”. The bureaucracy became subservient to the political clan and instead of working for the people started serving their interests and of their political masters. The loyalty to the nation was displaced by loyalty to political leadership. The bureaucracy got bosses belonging to one or the other political party. Selection of competent senior administrator for the highest post became a thing of the past. Honest and dedicated officers with traditional bureaucratic values were relegated to the background. Caste factor also came into play. This money came to him from the business class through bureaucrats. Money of the officers after elections became a usual affair. Those who favoured the party coming to power got lucrative postings while those who did not support it or gave no money for election fund were sent to remote areas or non – lucrative posts. Subordinates also followed the footsteps of their superiors. There was a price for moving a file or getting any other favour. Running after the file has become a part of our administrative culture. The Indian administrative got marked by slowness and red tapism. Bureaucratic arrogance became the trait of administrative culture. Rajiv Gandhi expressed his displeasure over the administrative culture in his speech delivered on Dec 28, 1985 “and what of the iron frame of system, the administrative services and the myriad functionaries of the state but as the proverb says there can be no protection if the fence starts eating the crop. This is what has happened. The fence has started eating the crop. We have government servants who do not serve but oppress the poor and the helpless, who do not uphold the laws but connive with those who cheat the state. They have no work ethic, no feeling for the public cause, no involvement in the future of the public cause, no of involvement in the future of the nation. They have only a grasping mercenary outlook, devoid of competence, integrity and commitment”.⁶

VI. IMPACT OF GLOBALISATION ON ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE IN INDIA.

Since the eighties, the world witnessed a reverse swing, ‘globalisation’ was the name given to the paradigmatic shift of emphasis towards a market, driven, private sector led ‘development’ model whose basic philosophy was to ‘roll back the state’. Changes in public administration today is in large part a reflection of the changing nature of the functions of government specially in the developed world. The practices of traditional public administration came under persistent attack from neo liberal economists, interest group, theorists and rational choice scholars who have spearheaded the philosophical arguments for reducing the size and spending of the public sector. Changes in the global ideological climate will therefore have an influence on the ‘what’ and ‘how’ of public administration. Initiated by the New Right movement in Britain and America and the ‘Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) of the World Bank, waves of economic reforms have swept through the public sector in the last two decades.⁷ Public administration in the era of globalisation has been donning a new robe of the ‘enabler’ or ‘facilitator’ by privatizing the substantial part of welfare delivery function⁸. Globalisation is increasingly changing the economic and political scenario of India. The interdependence has increased to the extent that economic recession in the United States has caused global recession down slowing the economic growth of all the states. India also has become the victim of global slowdown. The economic disturbance caused by global recession has adversely affected the law and order situation. Crime graph has increased and public discontentment against the Government is spreading widely. Due to poor liquidity of money with the banks, credit has squeezed and investment fallen. Under the



present disturbed conditions public administration in India is faced with the challenge of reshaping its structure, nature and functioning to cope with challenges of globalization⁹.

The concepts of 'New Public Management', 'Good Governance', and 'Entrepreneurial Government' have now all entered the lexicon of public administration. What emerges at the end the debate is a more flexible and open ended vision of governance and public administration.¹⁰

VII. NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT AS THE PRESENT ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE

The new conceptualizations in the discipline of public administration coinciding with the remarkable changes in the practice of governments and public agencies worldwide since the eighties have been termed has a paradigmatic shift and given the generic name of New Public Management (NPM)¹¹. NPM emerged seeking to redefine public administration in the radically altered global socio-economic and political circumstances in the aftermath of the demise of the former Soviet Union¹². NPM has been variously called: 'Managerialism' 'Market based public administration', 'Entrepreneurial Government' etc. The thrust has been toward a determined effort to implement the 3Es: Efficiency, Economy and Effectiveness¹³.

VIII. SALIENT FEATURES OF THE NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT

- Revamping of organizational structure
- Empowerment of Citizens
- Greater autonomy for public sector Manager
- Application of rigorous performance measurement technique
- Disaggregation of public bureaucracy
- Cost Cutting
- Use of Quasi-Markets and contracting out technique
- Emphasis on managerial support service
- Organizational and spatial decentralization.¹⁴

IX. RECOMMENDATIONS TO IMPLEMENT NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT IN INDIA

- **Conference of Chief Ministers of the States in May 1997**
An Action plan for Effective and Responsive Government, was discussed and adopted at the conference of Chief Ministers of the States in May 1997. The three main themes dealt with in the Action Plan were (i) accountable and citizen – friendly government (ii) transparency and right to information; and (iii) improving the performance and integrity of the public services¹⁵.
- **Fifth Pay Commission**
 - a) Downsizing the government through corporatisation of activities which involves 'manufacturing of goods or the provision of commercial services';
 - b) Transparency; openness and economy in the government operation through 'privatisation of activities where government does not need to play a direct role' and also 'contracting out of services which can be conveniently outsourced to the private sector'.
 - c) Contractual appointment in selected areas of operations for the purpose of maintaining a certain flexibility in staffing both for lateral entry of experts, moderating the number deployed depending on the exigencies of work and ensuring availability of most competent and committed personnel for certain sensitive/specialized jobs.
The central government has been advised to go for a thirty percent reduction in the strength of the civil services. The normal procedure of voluntary retirement after completing twenty years should be continued. The others significant recommendation of the commission concerns 'openness' in administration¹⁶.
- **Second Administrative Reforms Commission (ARC)**
The second ARC set up by the Government on 31 August 2005, under the chairmanship of Veerappa Moily suggested measures to achieve a 'proactive, responsive, accountable, sustainable and efficient administration for the country at all levels of the government. Some of the important recommendations of the commission include.
 - (i) A National Institution of Public Administration to be established to offer Bachelor's Degree courses in public administration, governance and management.
 - (ii) The permissible age for appearing in the civil services examinations to be 21-25 years for general candidate; 21-28 years for candidates for OBC candidates, and 21-29 years for candidates from SC/ST as well as physically challenged candidates.



- (iii) The number of permissible attempt should be three, five and six for the general, OBC, SC/ST/Physically handicapped candidates, respectively.
- (iv) As a capacity – building measure, it suggested that every government servant should undergo a mandatory training at the induction stage and also periodically during his/her career.
- (v) A central civil services authority to be set up which, among other things, would formulate guidelines for appointments at the ‘Senior Management level’ in the Government of India.
- (vi) Citizen – centricity, with the aim of ensuring satisfaction, is critical for any government which aims to provide good governance. Some of the measures suggested by the commission to make the administration citizen centric are the adoption of appropriate modern technology, right to information, citizens’ charter, grievance redressal mechanism, and active citizens’ participation (Second ARC 2009),
- (vii) In order to ensure ethics in governance, the commission recommends for the establishment of a national ombudsman to be called as ‘Rashtriya Lokayukta’.
- (viii) It suggests that the state vigilance commission/Lokayukta may be empowered to supervise the prosecution of corruption related cases.
- (ix) The commission recommends for greater devolution of powers and responsibilities in order to empower the local institution of governance.
- (x) The commission also recommends the all officers with a larger public interface should have an online complaint tracking system; and
- (xi) The commission in its first report titled right to information; master key to good governance has recommended that the official Secrets Act, 1923 be replaced and substituted by a chapter in the National Security Act. The Manual of office procedure be revised in the light of the provision of the Right to Information (RTI) Act, 2005.

- **Sixth Central Pay Commission**

The Government of India constituted the sixth central pay commission on 5 October 2006 which submitted its report on 24 March 2008.

The main recommendations of the commission are as follows:-

- i) **Reduction of layers:-** The commission has recommended reducing the layers within the government structure so that decisions making and delivery is expedited. From thirty five standard pay scales, the grades have been reduced to twenty, spread across four distinct running pay bands, one apex scale and another grade for the post of cabinet secretary and equivalent.
 - ii) **Restoring pride in public services:-** Government employees have to be motivated to take pride in public services. Thus, the commission has recommended various measures for job enhancement and job enrichment.
 - iii) **Delegation with accountability:-** Restoring delegation with accountability at each level in the decision making process is one of the main thrust areas proposed by the commission. Upgradation of critical cutting edge jobs like teachers, staff nurses, constables, and so on has been recommended.
 - iv) **Ensuring the availability of the best possibility talent for government:-** The Commission has recommended for lateral entry at higher level in the government to ensure availability of the best possible talent from within and outside government with performance contracts. It suggests a shift from carrier based to post based selection in the higher echelons of government in order to get the best domain – based expertise.
 - v) **Performance related incentive scheme (PRIS):-** The introduction of a PRIS is designed to reward performance, innovation, creativity and responsive delegated administration of stakeholder interface for inclusive outcome and service delivery¹⁷
- The Union Public Service Commission (UPSC) in 2001 appointed a committee of experts under the chairmanship of Yogendra Kumar Alagh to review the existing scheme of civil services examination. The Alagh Committee recommended an aptitude test with emphasis on comprehension, logical reasoning and problem solving and data analysis. Based on these recommendations the UPSC has finally changed the pattern of the preliminary examination. This entrance Test is rechristened as civil service aptitude test (CSAT) and is in practice from year 2011-12.
 - **Public Services Bill 2007**
Public Service bill propose:-
 - (i) Setting targets and priorities in line with government’s plans and available resources.
 - (ii) Preparation and periodical review of performance indicators of each employees with well defined principles for achievement¹⁸.



X. WORKING OF NPM IN INDIA

- **Right to Information Act** – In recognition of the need for transparency in public affairs, the Indian parliament enacted the Right to Information Act on 11 May 2005. The act provides for the proactive disclosure of information, establishment of the Information Commission, appointment of public information officers, procedures for getting information and so on. The act also defines ten categories of information that are exempted from disclosure because of their sensitive nature. These are information related to national security, information given in confidence by a foreign government, cabinet papers and trade and commercial secrets. Central Intelligence agencies and security agencies like the Intelligence Bureau (IB), Research and Analysis Wing (RAW), etc¹⁹.
- **Citizen's Charters:-** The citizen's charter is an important tool to improve the quality of services, address the needs of citizens' rights and set clear standard of performance²⁰. Citizen's charters have the potential to bridge the gap between citizen's expectations and quality of public service delivery through change of mindset of the service providers and discharge of their own responsibility by the citizen²¹. Since conference of the Chief Secretaries in November '96, the Government of India has introduced citizens charters in a number of department eg.(Income Tax Department, the LIC, the Railways and PWD etc.)²². So for 111 central ministries / departments / organizations have formulated citizens' charters in India²³.

As regards citizen's charters, in state, 23 states have issued more than 540 citizens' charters. Most of them relate to Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and Forests, Education, Electricity and Power Supply, Finance and Revenue, Food and Civil supplies, Health, Home and Police Administration, Industries, Labour and Employment, Local Bodies, Social Welfare, Transport and Urban Development. A few states have reported conducting training programmes to sensitise employees about their duties and responsibilities vis-à-vis citizen's charters (eg. Andhra Pradesh, Assam and Karnataka). To measure citizens' satisfaction, the Government of Gujarat has appointed Lok Praharis (peoples' watchmen). The Government of Punjab measures citizens' satisfaction on the basis of the percentage of disposal of grievances²⁴.

- **E-governance in India**

E-governance is the short form of 'electronic governance'. If the government is done through the use of Information and Communications Technology (ICT), it is said to be e-governance²⁵.

E-Government Initiatives in India: On Overview

The Government of India kick started the use of IT in the government in the right earnest by launching number of initiatives. First the Government approved the National E-Governance Action plan for implementation during the year 2003-2007. The plan is an attempt to lay the foundation and provide impetus for long-term growth of e-governance within the country.

Apart from the action plan, the following measures have also been introduced:

- Adoption of "Information Technology (IT) Act, 2000 by the Government of India to provide legal framework to facilitate electronic transactions.
- Establishment of the National Taskforce of Information Technology and Software Development in May 1998;
- Developing e-office solutions to enable various ministries and departments to do their work electronically. Modules such as Workflow for Drafts for Approvals, e-file, e-notings, submission of reports, integrated personal information and financial accounting systems have been developed;
- Setting up of a High Powered Committee (HPC) with Cabinet Secretary as its Chairman to improve administrative efficiency by using Information Technology in Government;
- Instituting websites by almost all Ministries and Departments and providing information on aspects such as their objectives, policies and decisions, contact persons, etc.

E-Government Initiatives at the State Level

Quite a number of state governments have initiated measures to introduce information technology and its tools in the governance process.

Project "Bhoomi" in the state of Karnataka

Karnataka being an agrarian state, was faced with the problem of maintaining immense land records and the work was done manually by the revenue officials. The recently launched project 'Bhoomi facilitated computerizations of entire 20 million records of land ownership of 6.7 million farmers in the state of Karnataka.



Project “Gyandoot” in the state of Madhya Pradesh

“Gyandoot” was launched on 1 January 2000, in poverty stricken, tribal-dominated rural areas of Madhya Pradesh. ‘Gyandoot’ is instrumental in establishing a link between government and the local population residing in the remote villages.

Project Smart Government in the State of Andhra Pradesh

The Government of Andhra Pradesh, in its endeavor to provide simple, moral, accountable, responsive and transparent governance to its people, launched ‘SMART GOVERNMENT’ (Smartgov) at the secretariat level. This project resulted in an automatic workflow in the secretariat and ensured not only internal efficiency but also provided an effective tool for performance evaluation.

Project Sustainable Access in Rural India (Sari) in the State of Tamil Nadu

People in a tiny village called pathinettangudi, 35 km from Madurai, Tamil Nadu, a state in south India, are enjoying the fruits of IT revolution. They are using e-mails, voice mail and web cams courtesy the Sustainable Access in Rural Internet (SARI) project.

Project Sampark in Chadigarh

Under this project electronic service centers known as ‘Sampark Centers’ have been established at different locations in the city. these centers provide different government services such as Payment of Taxes, Payment of Water, Sewerage, and Electricity Bills, Payment of Sticker/Postal Challan, Issue of Bus Passes, Issue of Senior Citizen Cards, Issue of Births and Death Certificates, Space Bookings, Tenant Registrations, Domestic Servants Registrations, Passport Applications, and selected Telephone Bills under a single roof there by reducing costs and saving time of the customers there being no jurisdiction limitation²⁶.

- **Privatization:-** With the adoption of the new economic policy in the early 1990s, there have been attempts at dismantling the centrally directed frame work of economic development major initiatives towards restricting of public sector units (PSU) were initiated in view of their low productivity over staffing, lack of technological upgradation and low rate of return. In order to raise resources and ensure wider public participation in PSUs, it was decided to offer its share holding stake to mutual funds, financial institutions, general public and workers. Similarly, in order to revive and rehabilitate chronically sick PSUs, it was decided to refer them to the Board for Industrial and Financial Reconstruction (BIFR). In order to promote the role of the private players, the National Mineral Policy (1993) de-reserved thirteen minerals for exploitation by the private sector, while the National Telecom Policy, 1994, allowed private participation in basic telecom services. The Air Corporation Act, 1994 enabled private air taxi companies to operate regular domestic services. The Fifty Pay Commission Report (1994) stated that it is increasing felt that in capital intensive infrastructural sectors like energy, telecommunication roads, ports and others, the shortfalls in investment are so large that a massive infusion of private investment is a must. Many states initiated special measures to attract FDI for greater industrialization in their region²⁷.
- **Role of NGO's:-** The new strategic approach to development has seen an increased focus on governance in all of its forms. This has involved support for not only state institutions but also for social institutions such as Non-governmental Organisation (NGOs) and other civil society actors advancing human rights, all with a focus on the role and responsibilities of citizens and their relationship with the state²⁸. In the seventh five year plan, great emphasis was laid on the involvement of voluntary agencies and other interest groups in making the bureaucracy more responsive to legitimate demands of citizens. The voluntary agencies provide counseling and spokesman services. The Standing Committees of Voluntary Agencies (SCOVA) have already been set-up in various departments, such as Youth Affairs; Sports, Pension and Pensions and Welfare and Health and Family Welfare. In India, Seva Mandir (Udaipur), Saheli (Jaipur) Aastha (Udaipur) and Sulabh International (New Delhi) are some of the NGOs working in the field. NGOs play the role of activities, executing programmes and delivering services and also as the mobilizers of opinions, awareness and support of the people concerned with and affected by social economic and political problems.
- **Decentralisation:-** The 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments signaled momentous changes in terms of grass roots peoples empowerment by providing for (a) regular elections (b) minimal suppression of Panchayat Raj bodies through an administrative fiat. (c) regular finance through statutory distribution by finance commission and (d) reservation of seats for weaker sections of society including women²⁹.
- **Lokpal and Lokayukta**

The first ARC recommended the setting up of ombudsman type of institution both at the centre and states for dealing with complaints against the administrative acts of ministers or secretaries. The authority at the centre to be called Lokpal and at the state the Lokayukta. Many states has constituted ‘Lokayuktas’ to investigate allegations or grievances arising out of the conduct of public servants including political executives, legislators, officers of the state government, local bodies, public enterprises and other instruments of government³⁰. After eight failed attempts to pass a lokpal Bill in the purt,



Parliament finally gave its seal of approval to a powerful Ombudsman on DEC 18 2013 the Lokpal is empowered to probe complaints against all public servants including Prime Minister.³¹

XI CONCLUSION

The need of day is a change in the approach of the public service. Today a more positive theory of personal administration is required which believes in creating positive motivation among officials. The aim is to make public official loyal, competent, satisfied and interested. A new type of administration is called for if our planning is to be a success. A New administrative culture has to be action minded, human relations – oriented, dynamic, public spirited; persuasive and cooperative. Today, civil servant can no longer command the people, he has to persuade and win their consent. There has been a great effort made in India for NPM type of government through decentralization of power to the local self governing bodies, people's RTI, introduction of citizens' charters by governance initiatives. India is heading towards a responsive, people centric and accountable administrative system. NPM in India which is basically driven by the measures of economic liberalization also aims at privatizing, downsizing, marketisation, contracting out and so on.

NOTES AND REFERENCE

1. Surendra Kumar – Indian Perspective of Administrative culture, p.1 Paperroom.ipsa.org.
2. Avasthi and Avasthi – Indian Administration (Lakshmi Narain Agarwal, Agra – 2013) p – 632.
3. U.C. Agarwal – Public Administration – Vision and reality. (Indian Institute of Public Administration, New Delhi) pp 314, 315.
4. Rumki Basu – Public Administration concepts and theories. (Sterling Publishers Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi – 2012). pp 104, 105.
5. Dubhashi P.R. – Recent Trends in Public Administration. (Kaveri Books, Delhi – 1995) pp. 88, 89.
6. Vishnoo Bhagwan and Vidya Bhushan – *Indian Administration (S. Chand and Company Ltd., New Delhi – 2011)* pp 410, 411.
7. Rumki Basu, op cit. p. 38.
8. Bidyut Chakraborty, Prakash Chand – *Public Administration in a Globalising world – Theories and practices (Sage Publications India Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi – 2012)* p. 480.
9. Vishnoo Bhagwan, op.cit, p. 441.
10. Rumki Basu, Op.Cit. p. 39
11. ibid, p 43
12. Bidyut Chakraborty, p 514.
13. Mohit Bhattacharya - *New Horizons of Public Administration* (Jawahar Publishers and Distributors, New Delhi – 2009) p.394.
14. Bidyut Chakraborty, op.cit pp 117,118, 119.
15. P.L.Sanjeev Reddy, Jaideep Singh, R.K.Tiwari – *Democracy, Governance and Globalisation (Indian Institute of Public Administration, New Delhi 2004)* p.291.
16. Rumki Basu op.cit. p.363.
17. Bidyut Chakraborty, op.cit pp-468, 470, 471, 472, 473.
18. *Performance Management in Government* – Prepared by centre for Good Governance – 2009. p.16, indiagovernance.gov.in
19. Bidyut Chakraborty, op-cit. pp 37, 378, 379.
20. *Performance Management*, op.cit. p.14.
21. P.L.Sanjeev Reddy, op.cit. p.294.
22. Rumki Basu, op.cit, pp 318, 320.
23. Bidyut Chakraborty, op.cit, p.377.
24. P.L.Sanjeev Reddy, op.cit., pp.294, 295
25. Bidyut Chakraborty, op.cit. p.373.
26. Anil Monga – *E-government in India: Opportunities and Challenges*, pp 55,56,57,58,59, Joag.com
27. Bidyut Chakraborty, op.cit. pp.462,463,464
28. Patrick Kilby – *Is Empowerment possible under a new Public management Environment? Some Lessons from India*, p.208.www.ipmn.net.
29. Bidyut Chakraborty, op.cit. pp. 380, 464.
30. Ibid, pp.370, 371.
31. Time of India. Dec. 19, 2013.